



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

IV.—*The Ablative of Association.*¹

BY PROF. CHARLES E. BENNETT,

CORNELL UNIVERSITY.

PRACTICALLY all recent investigators in the field of Indo-European case syntax agree in attributing to the Indo-European instrumental a sociative force, and in regarding the idea of means, which is so frequent a use of this case in most Indo-European languages, as developed from the idea of association. Those who reject these conclusions differ not in attributing another primitive 'Grundbegriff' to the Indo-European instrumental, but rather in refusing to attach to it any 'Grundbegriff' whatever.

The object of this paper cannot be to discuss the relative merits of these two views. Any such consideration, involving, as it does, fundamental principles of method in syntactical investigation, would, of necessity, take us far beyond the field of our present topic. I must therefore content myself with stating that my own conviction is at present firm that we are justified in attaching 'Grundbegriffe' to the chief inflectional forms of Indo-European, and that I am further in agreement with those who regard the Indo-European instrumental as having primarily a sociative force. My present purpose is to show that the range and frequency of the primitive sociative functions of the instrumental are much more extensive in Latin than is at present recognized. According to my observations it appears with verbs of joining, entangling, mixing, sharing, being attended, keeping company with, being accustomed, wedding, mating, piling, playing, changing and interchanging, agreeing, wrestling; also with adjectives of equality. Several, in fact most, of these categories, as will be indicated

¹ This investigation has had regard to the literature down to the time of Apuleius. While the lists of examples are quite full, it is not claimed that they are absolutely complete for all authors.

more fully later, unquestionably go back to the 'Ursprache.' I take the different categories up in order :

I. VERBS OF JOINING AND BEING JOINED.

These appear construed with the instrumental in Vedic (see Delbrück, *Altindische Syntax*, p. 131) and in Avestan (Hübschmann, *Casuslehre*, p. 255). The material in Latin is as follows :

iungo : *Leg. xii Tab.*, tignum iunctum aedibus vineave e concapi ne solvito ; *Cic. de Or.* i. 243, dicendi vis egregia summa festivitate et venustate coniuncta ; *ibid.* ii. 237, improbitas scelere iuncta ; *ibid.* iii. 55, quae vis est probitate iungenda summaque prudentia ; *id. Brut.* 162, defensione iuncta laudatio ; *id. ad Att.* ix. 10. 4, bellum iunctum miserrima fuga ; *Vell. Pat.* ii. 65. 3, consularem praetextam iungentem praetoria. In *Cicero, Tusc. Disp.* v. 96, the Mss. read expectatio speratarum voluptatum perceptarum memoria iungeretur. Madvig inserted *cum* before *perceptarum*, and most — possibly all — subsequent editors have followed him. The change seems to be unnecessary. Ebrard, *de Ablativi Locativi Instrumentali etc. Usu*, p. 618, cites *Lex. Iul. Munic.*, plostra bubus iumentisve iuncta, as an instance of this ablative, but *bubus* here may be dative. The dative is authenticated for *Lucretius* i. 713, iungentes terram liquori. The ablative with *cum* is also an alternative construction found as early as *Lucretius*, e.g. v. 438 ; vi. 1075.

coniungo : *Lucr.* ii. 743, nullo coniuncta colore ; *Cic. pro Cluentio*, 12, libido non solum dedecore verum etiam scelere coniuncta ; *id. pro Sest.* 132, civis coniunxit eodem periculo et crimine ; *id. Phil.* iii. 35, summa miseria est summo dedecore coniuncta ; *ps.-Virg. Ciris*, 40, coniunctum carmine nomen ; *Virg. Aen.* x. 653, ratis coniuncta crepidine saxi ; *Vitruv. de Arch.* x. 20. 2, tignum quo capreoli coniungantur. Besides the simple ablative, we find also the ablative with *cum*, e.g. *Lucr.* iii. 159 ; iv. 493. The dative also occurs, e.g. *Cic. de Off.* ii. 34, intelligentiae iustitia coniuncta. Hence numerous examples are ambiguous. Doubtless some of them are ablatives.

confundo : *Cic. de Div.* i. 118, quae (vis sentiens) est toto confusa mundo ; *ibid.* ii. 35, quae (vis divina) toto confusa mundo sit ; *Col. de Re Rustica*, x. 260, ingenuo confusa rubore rosa. The construction with *cum* appears as early as *Cicero*, e.g. *Timaetus*, 49, cum ignis

oculorum cum eo igni se confudit. The dative occurs in Ovid, *de Med. Fac.* 61, cornua pulvereae confusa farinae, and elsewhere. Hence passages like Horace, *Sat.* ii. 4. 67, *Ep.* ii. 1. 195, and others are ambiguous.

contineo : *Lex. Iul. Munic.* 53, semitam eo aedificio perpetuo continentem. I should also bring under this head Cic. *pro Marcello*, 22, tua salute contineri, 'is bound up with your safety.' But Cic. *pro Caecina*, 11, huic fundo continentia praedia, shows the dative, and assures the character of *pro Caec.* 15, fundo antiquo continens, and of *in Pis.* 11, continentis his funeribus dies.

haereo : Virg. *Aen.* x. 361, haeret pede pes ; Hor. *Sat.* ii. 3. 205, haerentes litore ; Ovid, *Met.* vi. 236, haeret cervice summa sagitta ; 290, haerentia viscere tela ; *ibid.* ix. 351, haerent radice pedes ; *ibid.* xii. 184, haereat pectore res ; Lucan, i. 507, limine haesit ; *id.* vi. 210, haerentis cute hastas ; 567, haerentem gutture ; Sen. *Thy.* 548, haerere fratris aspectu ; *id.* *Phaedra*, 1101, haesere biiuges vulnere ; *id.* *Oct.* 744, haerens amplexu mariti. But the dative also occurs, e.g. in Virg. *Aen.* iv. 73, haeret lateri letalis harundo ; so often in poetry.

cohaereo : Ovid, *Am.* i. 4. 43, nec crure cohaere. The construction with *cum* also occurs as early as Cic. *Top.* 53, id cohaeret cum re ; also the dative, e.g. Quint. iv. 2. 89, verae alicui rei cohaereat. Hence many passages are ambiguous, including those cited in Harper's Dict., s.v. II. A. 1, as datives, all of which may be ablatives.

apto : Stat. *Theb.* x. 309, aptatam cava testudine dextram percutit, gives us a sure instance of the ablative. Horace also has three examples which, though ambiguous, may belong here, viz. *Epodes*, 7. 1, cur dexteris aptantur enses conditi ? *Odes*, ii. 12. 4, aptari citharae modis ; *Epp.* i. 3. 12, fidibusne Latinis Thebanos aptare modos ; and Propertius one, iii. 3. 35, haec carmina nervis aptat. The *Thes. Ling. Lat.* classifies all these as datives, but in view of the Statius passage they may possibly be ablatives.

inhaereo : Virg. *Aen.* x. 845, corpore inhaeret ; Cic. *Tusc. Disp.* ii. 20, latere inhaerens, a poetical translation by Cicero himself of Soph. *Trach.* 1046 ff. So also in the same paragraph just before the beginning of the poetical translation we have, inhaesisset ea visceribus.

The case in the following examples of verbs of *joining* is more or less doubtful :

copulo : Lucr. vi. 1078, denique non auro res aurum copulat una. Landgraf, *Beiträge z. hist. Synt. d. lat. Spr.*, p. 19, suggests that *auro* here may be ablative. Ebrard, from his silence, though his lists are very incomplete, may be thought to regard it as dative. Cicero repeatedly uses the ablative with *cum*; the dative only once, viz. *de Div.* ii. 143, naturae copulatum. The dative is found also in Livy, xxi. 28. 8.

necto : Lucr. v. 1202, votis nectere vota; Prop. iii. 5. 12, armis nectimus arma nova; Virg. *Aen.* iv. 239, pedibus talaria nectit. Cic. uses the dative in *de Div.* i. 125, causae causa nexa. Landgraf, *Beiträge*, p. 20, suggests that in the Lucretius passage the case may be ablative.

revincio : Lucr. v. 553, partibus aeriis caeloque revincta; cf. v. 537, (naturam) coniunctam atque aptam partibus aeriis mundi; see below under **aptus**.

coeo : Hor. *A.P.* 12, placidis coeant immitia.

constringo : In Cic. *Ac. Post.* i. 11, (me) multis officiis implicatum et constrictum, *officiis* is quite as much dependent upon *constrictum* as upon *implicatum*. With the latter word, as will be shown later, the only construction in Cicero (barring prepositional phrases) is the ablative; *officiis* is therefore here in the ablative case. Hence it is possible that the following also belongs under the sociative head, Hor. *Sat.* i. 6. 23, fulgente trahit constrictos Gloria curru, 'bound to (or tied up with) her car.'

aptus : In Plaut. *Trin.* 658 the Ambrosianus reads *otio aptus*; the P Mss. have *captus*. Of recent editors, Götz-Schöll, Lindsay, and Morris read *aptus*; Leo, *captus*. The reading *captus* is also preferred by the *Thes. Ling. Lat.* s.v. *aptus*; *aptus* seems to me the more likely reading here. Nonius defines *aptum* as *conexum et colligatum*; so Festus, p. 18, defines by *comprehendere vinculo*; Isidore, xix. 30. 5, by *ligare*. I therefore interpret *otio aptus* as meaning 'entangled with (or in) indolence.'

In Lucr. v. 537 we read (naturam) coniunctam atque aptam partibus aeriis mundi; here also the probability seems to me strong that we have the ablative. Cic. *de Leg.* i. 56, ex natura vivere, id est vita modica et apta virtute perfrui, is doubtful. Does *apta virtute* mean 'linked with virtue,' 'combined with virtue'? I believe it does. Merguet in his lexicon to the philosophical works of Cicero seems so to take it. Zumpt and Baiter conjecture *e virtute*.

2. VERBS OF *ENTANGLING* AND *INVOLVING*.

alligo : Cic. *pro Flacco*, 41, ne se scelere alliget ; *pro Rab. Post.* 14, ne qua nova quaestione alligaretur.

astringo : Cic. *pro Sest.* 108, scelere astringi ; *id. de Off.* iii. 19, num se astrinxit scelere? *id. pro Sulla*, 82, tanto scelere astrictis hominibus ; *id. Phil.* iv. 9, magno scelere se astringeret ; Sall. *Iug.* 60. 6, studio suorum astrictis ; *ibid.* 70. 2, maioribus (rebus) astricto ; Val. Max. iv. 7. 4, vitam suam consilii crimine astrinxit ; Fronto, 227, 11, N., cottidiano te mendacio astringi.

devincio : Ter. *Haut.* 208, ubi animus semel se cupiditate devinxerit mala ; Cic. *de Domo Sua*, 131, si templum religione Concordiae devinxisset ('should connect the temple with the worship of the goddess Concord') ; *id. de Har. Resp.* 5, quo scelere se devinxerit ; *pro Cael.* 52, eodem se scelere devinxit.

illigo : Cic. *Tusc. Disp.* ii. 20, ipse illigatus peste interimor textili, Cicero's own poetical translation of Soph. *Trach.* 1046 ff. ; Hor. *Odes*, i. 27. 23, illigatum Chimaera ; Val. Max. vi. 8. 4, dextram torpore illigavit ; Tac. *Ann.* iii. 21. 16, illigatus praeda ; xv. 51. 6, conscientia illigare. The dative is nowhere authenticated, and *cum* occurs in Pliny, *N.H.* xxviii. 14. 58. 203. Hence I should also regard as ablatives the following : Cic. *Ac.* ii. 6, sermonibus illigari ; *id. de Domo Sua*, 40, Caesaris actis illigatus teneretur ; Hor. *Epodes*, i. 25, iuvenis illigata aratra ; Livy, xxxii. 21. 11, illigari bello ; Val. Max. ix. 13. 4, duarum matrimonio illigatus ; Tac. *Hist.* iii. 46. 17, bello illigari ; *id. Ann.* ii. 27. 11, quo pluribus indiciis illigaret (sc. Libonem) ; *ibid.* vi. 32. 7, veneno illigaret ; *ibid.* xii. 25. 3, stupro illigatus ; *ibid.* xiii. 40. 2, locis se illigaret ; *ibid.* xv. i. 7, bellis illigatus ; Min. Fel. *Oct.* 16. 5, facultatibus illigatos.

impedio : Plaut. *Amph.* p. 53 of Götz and Schöll, *Frag.* x, qui domi uxorem meam impudicitia impedivit ('has involved her in shame') ; Ter. *Phorm.* 442, me et se hisce nuptiis impedivit.

implecto : Tac. *Ann.* xvi. 10. 13, vidua implexa continuo luctu ; Min. Fel. *Oct.* 20. 3, Centauros equos suis hominibus implexos. In view of the great frequency of the ablative with *implicitus* and *implicatus* (see the next rubric), it seems likely that the following examples also belong here : Virg. *Georg.* iv. 482, implexae crinibus angues Eumenides ; Apul. *de Mag.* p. 457 (Hild.), hirudines dentibus (crocodili) implectuntur.

implico : Plaut. *Merc.* 14, sed ea ut sim implicitus dicam. The Mss. here read *eam*. Götz and Schöll follow this, but Leo and Lindsay accept Lambinus's conjecture of *ea*. In view of the very great frequency of *implico* with the ablative, *ea* seems the much more probable reading here ; Varro, *Sat. Men.* p. 234 (Riese), imber grandine implicatus ; Cic. *pro Quinctio*, 3, rem controversiis implicatam ; *id. Verr.* II. ii. 44, ipse tua defensione implicabere ; *ibid.* iii. 82, omnibus legibus implicatum ; *ibid.* v. 150, implicatum severitate iudicum ; *id. de Domo Sua*, 105, religionibus implicuisses ; *id. de Har. Resp.* 7, exspectatione supplicii implicatus ; *id. pro Cael.* 71, eo maleficio implicati ; *id. pro Balbo*, 60, nostris familiaritatibus implicantur ; *id. in Pis.* 70, familiaritate implicatus ; *ibid.* 86, criminibus implicata ; *id. pro Rab. Post.* 19, his causis implicati ; *id. pro Lig.* 1. 3, nullo negotio implicari ; *id. Phil.* ii. 81, implicata inscientia impudentia ; *id. Phil.* xii. 3, pacificatoria legatione implicatos ; *in Vatin.* 1. 3, inconstantia tua cum levitate tum etiam periurio implicata ; *id. Tusc. Disp.* iv. 58, neglecta ratio multis implicatur erroribus ; *id. Tusc. Disp.* v. 3, angoribus et molestiis implicatos ; *id. de Nat. Deo.* i. 51, occupationibus implicatus ; *ibid.* i. 52, implicatus negotiis ; *id. de Fin.* ii. 45, se implicet civium societate ; *id. Ac.* i. 11, officiis implicatum ; *id.* ii. 105, nulla re implicato ; *id. de Div.* i. 79, quam (vim di) hominum naturis implicant ; *id. de Off.* i. 117, implicatur aliquo certo genere cursuque vivendi ; *ibid.* ii. 40, negotiis implicantur ; *Lael.* 45, alienis (rebus) implicari ; *id. Frag. F.* v. 97, implicuerint hominum vitiis et erroribus. Cicero also uses *cum* with the ablative, e.g. *de Imp. Cn. Pomp.* 19, haec ratio implicata est cum illis pecuniis. He never uses the dative.¹ Hence all examples which might seem ambiguous have been classed as ablatives. The first appearance of the dative seems to be in Augustan poets, viz., in Virg. *Aen.* ii. 724, dextrae se parvus implicuit. Further instances of the ablative are : Caes. *B. C.* iii. 18. 1, graviore morbo implicitus ; Nep. *Dion.* 1. 1, utraque implicatus tyrannide ; Virg. *Cul.* 200, implicuit formidine mentem ; Ov. *Ars Am.* i. 561, implicitam sinu ; *id. Her.* 9. 94, implicitis angue comis ; Vitruv. *de Arch.* ii. 8. 12, morbo implicare ; *ibid.* iv. 1. 9, nuptiis implicata ; Val. Max. i. 7. 4, religione implicaret ; *id.* ii. 7. 10, implicatis desperatione vitae ; *id.* iii. 6. 1, relatione implicet ; *id.* v. 5. 3, labore implicatus ; *id.* vii. 4. 5, implicavit

¹ Pascal, *Dizionario dell' uso Ciceroniano*, s.v. *implico*, recognizes the dative for Cicero, but without reason, it seems to me. I have discovered no certain instance of the dative, nor does Pascal cite any.

exercitum suum ignorantia ; Lucan, iii. 432, terrore implicitus ; Celsus, *Medic.* iii. 21, eo morbo implicitum ; Val. Flacc. *Arg.* v. 451, implicat igne domus ; Sil. Ital. *Pun.* ix. 629, implicitum nexu ; *ibid.* xv. 618, implicat errore vias ; Tac. *Hist.* iii. 77. 9, pari formidine implicabuntur ; *Ann.* xi. 8. 13, implicatur obsidione ; *id.* *Ger.* 45. 21, implicata umore ; Pliny, *Epp.* vii. 19. 2, hoc discrimine implicata est. The regularity of the ablative and extreme rarity of the dative make it practically certain that the following examples also are in the ablative : Virg. *Aen.* xi. 108, vos fortuna implicuit bello ; Hor. *A.P.* 424, litibus implicitum ; Livy, iii. 2. 1, morbo implicitum ; so vii. 23. 2 ; xxiii. 40. 1 ; Lucr. vi. 1232 ; Val. Max. i. 7. 1 ; *id.* i. 8. Ext. 16, implicabatur febris ; *id.* iii. 1. Ext. 1, implicati finitimo bello ; *id.* ix. 1. Ext. 2, implicarunt urbem cladibus (in Val. Max. ix. 9. *ad init.* we have apparently a clear case of the dative, implicat se culpa) ; Val. Flacc. *Arg.* v. 254, spiris nemus implicat ; *id.* iii. 31, erroribus implicet urbem ; *id.* iii. 389, sontes poenis implicat ; *id.* viii. 19, sinus venenis implicat ; Tac. *Ann.* xii. 4. 3, consiliis implicari ; *ibid.* iv. 53. 1, morbo implicata.

intorqueo : Cic. *pro Caec.* 77, verbo ac littera ius intorqueri ; Sil. Ital. *Pun.* v. 535, intorquens nubem nigranti turbine. So also probably Hor. *Odes*, ii. 13. 35, intorti capillis Eumenidum.

involve : Cic. *Phil.* vii. 19, pacis nomine bellum involutum ; Val. Max. vii. 3. Ext. 10, involutum benevolentiae simulatione mendacium ; Tac. *Ann.* i. 70. 15, cuncta pari violentia involvebantur. No case of the dative is attested. Hence I should regard as probably ablative the following : Varro, *Sat. Men.* p. 217, 6 (Riese), adest fax involuta incendio ; Lucr. vi. 443, ut involvat venti se nubibus vortex ; Cic. *Ac. Post.* i. 15, rebus ipsa natura involuta ; Val. Max. i. 7. 5, involvendum silentio ; Pliny, *Epp.* i. 5. 7, me laqueis involveram ; Tac. *Ann.* xiv. 30. 9, igni suo involvit ; *ibid.* xvi. 32. 14, fraudibus involutos.

irretio : Cic. *Tusc. Disp.* ii. 20, me irretivit veste, Cicero's own poetic translation of Soph. *Trach.* 1046 ff. ; *id.* *pro Mil.* 54, cum paenula irretitus esset ; *id.* *ad Quir.* 11, provinciarum foedere irretiti (Mss. *irritati, irinati*). No instance of the dative is attested. Hence I should regard as ablatives the following examples also : Cic. *Tusc. Disp.* v. 62, irretierat erratis ; *id.* *de Har. Resp.* 7, irretitus odio bonorum omnium.

obligo : Cic. *de Domo Sua*, 20, populum Romanum scelere obligasses ; *ibid.* 124, bona Lentuli religione obligavit ; *ibid.* 106, huius

domum religione sempiterna obligare; *id. pro Murena*, 3, se nexu obligavit; *id. de Har. Resp.* 27, castissimos ludos omni scelere obligares; *id. de Div.* i. 7, ne impia fraude aut anili superstitione obligemur; Hor. *Odes*, ii. 8. 5, obligasti perfidum votis caput; Ovid, *Am.* iii. 12. 42, obligat verba fide ('ties not its words to the accuracy of history'); Suet. *Iul.* 42, cum se scelere obligarent.

obstringo: Cic. *in Verr.* II. i. 8, se tot sceleribus obstrinxerit; *id.* iv. 71, tanto scelere se obstrictum esse sentiat; *id.* v. 179, tanto scelere se obstrinxerunt; *id. pro Sulla*, 6, obstrictum patriae parricidio; *id. pro Cael.* 47, obstrictus voluptatibus; *id. in Pis.* 95, pari scelere obstrictos; *id. Phil.* xi. 14, se obstrinxerit parricidiis; *ibid.* 29, se patriae parricidio obstrinxerit; *id. de Off.* iii. 83, se eo (parricidio) obstrinxerit; *id. Epp.* xi. 10. 5, amicos aere alieno obstrinxerim; Caesar, *B. C.* ii. 32. 4, vos scelere obstringere; Livy, iv. 17. 5, obstringi conscientia tanti sceleris; *id.* xxvi. 48. 12, se periurio obstringere; Tac. *Hist.* iv. 55. 12, aliquem conscientia obstrinxere; *Ann.* xiv. 57. 4, aliquem societate scelerum obstringere; Suet. *Iul.* 27, faenore obstrictis.

The following examples of constructions with verbs of entangling and involving are less certain:

illaqueo: Cic. *de Har. Resp.* 7, illaqueatus periculis. This expression occurs combined with the phrase *irretitus odio*, where *odio* is probably ablative; see above under *irretio*.

teneo: Possibly the following passage belongs under the construction we are considering: Plaut. *Pseud.* 1110, nisi ut improbis artibus teneant, 'hold to bad ways,' 'involve themselves in bad ways.'

3. VERBS OF MIXING.

These occur combined with the instrumental in Avestan (Hübschmann, *Casuslehre*, p. 255) and Slavic (Miklosich, *Grammatik der slavischen Sprachen*, IV. p. 701). In Greek and Gothic we have the dative, which in both those languages has probably inherited instrumental functions. In Latin we have:

admisceo: Lucr. iv. 1247, admiscetur muliebri semine semen; Varro, *de Re Rust.* i. 9. 3, terra admixta aliqua re; Cic. *de Nat. Deo.* ii. 27, aer multo calore admixtus; *ibid.* ii. 39, neque sidera ulla praeterea sunt admixta natura; Caes. *B. C.* iii. 48, genus radicis

admixtum lacte¹; Pliny, *N.H.* xxx. 141, lutea admixta pondere. The dative occurs with some frequency from Cicero on; see *e.g.* *de Nat. Deo.* ii. 26. We also find *cum* with the ablative in Cato, *de Agr.* 115, 2, vites ne admisceas cum cetero vino, and a few times in later writers; see *Thes. Ling. Lat.* s.v. p. 746, 12 ff. Yet several of the examples cited by the *Thesaurus* as ablatives are quite as likely to be datives.

commisceo: Enn. *Trag. Frag.* 196 (Vahlen²), commixta stellis splendidis; Lucr. iv. 1257, semina seminibus commisceri; *id.* v. 502, liquidum corpus turbantibus aeris auris commiscet; *id.* vi. 322, commixta (vis venti) calore; *id.* vi. 1159, gemitu commixta querella; Virg. *Aen.* iii. 633, frusta cruento commixta mero; *ibid.* vi. 762, commixtus sanguine; *ibid.* viii. 255, commixtis igne tenebris; *id. Georg.* ii. 327, magno commixtus corpore; Hor. *Sat.* i. 10. 24, Chio nota si commixta Falerni est; Scrib. Larg. *Comp.* 32, (croci) aqua pluviali commiscentur; Vitruv. *de Arch.* ii. 4. 3, calx palea commixta; *ibid.* vii. 1. 2, commisceantur quercu; Suet. *Iul.* 81, libellum libellis ceteris commiscent; *id. Vit.* 2, salivis melle commixtis; *id. Dom.* 17, reliquias Phyllidis cineribus Iuliae commixtas; *commisceo* is construed also with *cum* and the ablative in Lucr. (*e.g.* vi. 276, ventus cum eo commiscuit igni), Cato, and Cicero. The dative apparently does not occur.

misceo: Acc. *Trag.* 83 (Ribbeck), sanguine sanguen miscere suo; Pac. *Trag.* 414 (R.), grando mixta imbri largifico; Varro, *Sat. Men.* p. 151 (Riese), atque Aeneae misceri sanguine sanguen; *ibid.* p. 201 (R.), frigus calore atque umore aritudinem miscet; Lucr. ii. 576, miscetur funere vapor; *id.* ii. 579, mixtos vagitibus aegris ploratus; *id.* iii. 233, mixta vapore; *id.* iii. 842, terra mari miscebitur et mare caelo; *id.* vi. 159, grandine mixti; *id.* vi. 371, frigore mixtus; *id.* vi. 941, mixtum corpus inani; *id.* vi. 1072, latices aquai fontibus misceri. Lucretius also uses the dative, *e.g.* iii. 234, nec calor quisquam cui mixtus non siet aer. But this is the only instance. Hence ambiguous forms in the above citations have with some confidence been classed as ablatives.² Cicero, *pro Scauro*, 13, crudelitate mixtas libidines; *id. Tim.* 44, voluptate et molestia mixtum amorem; *id. de Off.* ii. 48, mixta modestia gravitas; *id. Rep.* ii. 1, gravitate

¹ The Mss. and editors are divided here between *lacte* and *lacti*. Du Pontet, Kübler, and Meusel read *lacte*; the *Thesaurus* reads *lacti* (s.v. *admisceo*).

² This accords also with the opinion of Hidén, *de Casuum Synt. Lucr.* ii. p. 80, and of Landgraf, *Beiträge*, p. 22.

mixtus lepos; *id. de Nat. Deo.* i. 75, candore mixtus rubor; Cat. 64, 95, curis qui gaudia miscet; *id.* 68. 18, curis miscet amaritiam; Sall. *Iug.* 57, 5, picem sulpure et taeda mixtam; *Auct. Bell. Alex.* 56, 2, mixtam dolore voluptatem; Hor. *Sat.* ii. 4. 24, miscebat mella Falerno; *ibid.* ii. 4. 55, Surrentina miscet faece Falerna vina; Col. *de Re Rust.* vi. 4, sale miscent pabula; Phaed. i. 14. 8, antidoto miscere toxicum; Ov. *Am.* i. 9. 16, mixtas imbre nives; *id. Ars Am.* ii. 417, piper urticae semine miscent; *id. Her.* 6. 76, ira mixtus amor; *ibid.* 16. 200, nectare miscet aquas; *id. Met.* iv. 504, sanguine mixta recenti; *ibid.* xi. 595, nebulae caligine mixtae; *ibid.* ix. 130, mixtus tabe sanguis; *id. Fas.* iv. 626, ventus grandine mixtus; *ibid.* v. 380, flavi corpore mixtus equi; *ibid.* v. 405, sanguine Centauri Lernaee sanguis Echidnae mixtus; *ibid.* vi. 566, mixtis sanguine aquis; *id. Trist.* iv. 3. 12, spes mixta metu (Ovid also uses *cum* with the ablative, e.g. *Met.* xii. 256, mixtos cum sanguine dentes; also sometimes the dative. An example of the latter is *Met.* iv. 140, fletum cruori miscuit. Hence many examples are ambiguous, e.g. *Trist.* iii. 10. 28; *Ars Am.* i. 663; *Pont.* ii. 10. 26). Virgil, *Aen.* vi. 727, mens miscet se corpore; *ibid.* xii. 68, mixta rubent lilia rosa; *ibid.* 838, Ausonio mixtum sanguine; *Cir.* 76, misceret sanguine pontum. Virgil uses the dative in *Aen.* viii. 431, metum miscebant operi. Hence the case in *Aen.* vii. 661 and *Georg.* iii. 516, may be dative. Further instances of the ablative are: Val. Max. i. 6. 5, aquas sanguine mixtas; Vell. Pat. ii. 98, 3, mores eius vigore et lenitate mixtissimos; Vitruv. *de Arch.* vii. 14. 1, vaccinium lacte miscentes; Lucan, iv. 679, mixti Garamante Marmaridae; *id.* x. 32, miscuit sanguine amnes; Quint. ii. 8. 11, alterum alterius natura miscendum; Mart. i. 87. 5, mixtum diapasmate virus. Tacitus shows the dative in *Hist.* v. i. 7 and elsewhere; *cum* with the ablative is found in *Ann.* xvi. 34. 10. Numerous examples in Tacitus are ambiguous, but no certain instance of the ablative appears. Juvenal, i. 69, quae Calenum miscet rubeta; Stat. *Theb.* i. 208, mixta maiestate; *ibid.* v. 197, mixtus caligine; *ibid.* vi. 197, fletu verba miscens; *ibid.* viii. 609, miscent sermone querelas.

The dative, though not frequent till the Augustan poets, is found as early as Enn. *Epich.* 2 (V.²), frigori miscet calorem umori aritudinem.

permisceo: Lucr. iii. 351, animam permixtam corpore toto. Hidén, *de Casuum Synt. Lucr.* II, p. 88, takes *corpore* here as a locative ablative; Ebrard, *de Abl. Loc. Instr.*, p. 626, as sociative. I can see no ground whatever for dissociating it from the similar

constructions with *misceo* and *permisceo* and for putting it in the locative category. The following ambiguous example from Lucretius is probably also ablative: ii. 990, *seminibus permixta*. Cic. *pro Planc.* 92, *fructus acerbitate permixti*; Virg. *Aen.* xi. 634 reads, *permixti caede virorum equi*. Hence I should regard *Aen.* x. 416, *cerebro permixta cruento*, as illustrating the ablative; also probably Hor. *Odes*, i. 1. 23, *lituo tubae permixtus sonitus*. Sall. *Iug.* 60. 2, *has, clamor permixtus hortatione*; hence in *Cat.* 22, *sanguinem vino permixtum*, *vino* is probably ablative. Val. Max. has the ablative in iv. 6. 2, *spiritum luctus acerbitate permixtum*. The dative occurs in i. 8. 11. Further instances of the ablative are: Lucan, i. 190, *gemitu permixta*; ii. 152, *permixta viva sepultis*; iii. 138, *permiscent dies summa imis*; iii. 577, *permixtus sanguine pontus*; iii. 658, *permixtus viscere sanguis*; also probably iv. 196, *castris permixtus*; Sil. Ital. iii. 197, *hiemem permixtam grandine*; Stat. *Theb.* viii. 712, *permixtus sudore et sanguine*; *ibid.* x. 312, *sanguine permixti latices*; *id. Silv.* ii. 2. 32, *permixti pulvere soles*. So also probably, *Theb.* x. 113, *vera falsis permixta*, and *Silv.* v. 3. 170, *permixtus ignis aquis*. *Cum* with the ablative also occurs, e.g. Cic. *in Vat.* 13, *tuas sordes cum splendore permisceas*. The dative occurs in Livy, xxi. 14. 1, *permixtum senatui populi concilium*.

remisceo: The following passages are all obviously ambiguous. The case may be dative: Horace, *A.P.* 151, *veris falsa remiscet*; *Odes*, iv. 15, 30, *remixto carmine tibiis*; Sen. *de Const.* 7. 4, *venenum remixtum cibo*. The dative is certain for Sen. *Ep.* 71. 16, *animus naturae (natura P) suae remiscebitur*.

4. VERBS OF SHARING AND PARTICIPATING.

These occur in Avestan construed with the instrumental (Hübschmann, *Casuslehre*, p. 255).

communico: Plaut. *Mil. Glo.* 51, *communicabo te mensa mea*; *cum* with the ablative occurs in Sall. *Cat.* 56. 5, *causam civium cum servis communicasse*.

participo: Plaut. *Mil. Glo.* 261, *quin sermone aliquem participaverit*; Cic. *de Leg.* i. 33, *sequitur ad participandum alium alio nos esse factos*; Apuleius, *Met.* ix. 33, *meum dominum prandio participat*. By an extension of this usage we find the ablative with the adjective *particeps* in Sen. *Herc. Fur.* 369, *particeps regno*; cf. Vel-

leius' use of *mixtissimus* with the ablative in ii. 98. 3, *mores eius vigore et lenitate mixtissimos*.

socio: As certain examples of the construction under discussion I should regard Virg. *Aen.* i. 598, *quae nos urbe domo socias*, 'that makest us partners in thy city and home'; Lucan, i. 314, *Pompeium continuo sociabunt* [vulgate, *satiabunt*] *regno*; Apuleius, *Met.* viii. 1, *factionibus sociatus*. Cicero repeatedly uses *cum* and the ablative in connection with *sociare*, e.g. *de Or.* iii. 131, *qui vim rerum cognitionemque cum scientia sociaris*. The following examples are less certain: Hor. *Odes*, iv. 9. 4, *verba socianda chordis*; Ovid, *Met.* xi. 5, *sociantem carmina nervis*; Stat. *Theb.* iii. 282, *me sociare marito*. In Allen and Greenough's *New Latin Grammar* § 429. 3, *socius* is recognized as taking the ablative. The authors cite Sall. *Iug.* 85. 47, *socius periculis*, and explain the ablative as locative. Were the reading correct we might recognize a sociative use. But all our Mss. except V give *periculi*, which seems to be the reading of editors since Dietsch. Lucan, vii. 716, *socius cladibus*, may, however, illustrate the ablative.

consocio: Pomponius Mela, ii. 7. 16, has *consociare se pelago*; *pelago* here may be ablative, though it is usually taken as dative. In favor of recognizing the ablative in this passage is the frequent use of *cum* with the ablative in connection with *consocio*. No instance of the dative is attested.

5. VERBS OF ACCUSTOMING AND BEING ACCUSTOMED.

assuefacio: Cic. *in Cat.* ii. 9, *assuefactus frigore et fame et siti et vigiliis preferendis*. The idea is, 'made familiar with.' Further examples are: Cic. *Brut.* 213, *puro sermone assuefacta domus*; *id. de Or.* iii. 39, *sermone assuefacti*; Caesar, *B.G.* iv. 1. 9, *nullo officio aut disciplina assuefacti*; *id. B.C.* i. 44. 2, *barbaro genere pugnae assuefacti*; Val. Max. viii. 7, Ext. 15, *Persico sermone se adsuuefecit*. The dative also occurs, — first in Livy, then in Pliny, Frontinus, and Tacitus.

assuesco: Cic. *de Or.* iii. 58, *labore assueti*; Virg. *Aen.* vii. 746, *adsueta venatu*; Ovid, *Met.* xiii. 554, *praedae assuetus amore*; Livy, xxxi. 35. 3, *genus pugnae quo assueverant*; Sen. *Contr.* i. 2. 8, *assuetus humano sanguine*; *id. Contr.* ii. 1, *utroque assuevi*; Celsus, *de Med.* 1 *praef.* p. 12 (Dar.), *uno cibo non prandio quoque assuetus*; Col. *de Arb.* i. 4, *ut vitis exiguo assuescat umore*; Quint. Curt.

vi. 3. 8, tot gentes alterius imperio ac nomine assuetas ; Pliny, *N.H.* 23. 44, assuetas meri potu ; Lucan, v. 776, adulescentis fati ; Stat. *Theb.* iv. 655, uivifera Rhodopen assueverat umbra ; Florus, i. 1. 7, assuetus sanguine et praeda ; *id.* ii. 27. 17, barbaros signis et disciplina assueverat ; Fronto, p. 206. 20 (N.), ne armatu quidem sustinendo assueti ; Apuleius, *Plato*, 2. 20, assuetus voluptate. The dative is also frequent, beginning with Ovid. Hence many examples are ambiguous.

consuesco : Ter. *Adelphoe*, 666, qui illa consuevit prior ; cf. Plaut. *Cist.* 86, tu cum quiquam viro consuevisti ? Cic. in *Verr.* II. v. 30, quibuscum iste consueverat. The reading of the *Adelphoe* passage follows the Bembinus. Interpolated Mss. have *cum illa*, which is metrically impossible. Donatus knew a variant *illam*, which Dziatzko suggested might possibly be correct. Fleckeisen in his last edition reads *qui cum ea*, an unnecessary and, in my judgment, entirely unwarrantable tampering with the text ; Columella, *de Re Rust.* viii. 15, quae (aves) consuevere libero victu ; *ibid.* viii. 13. 1, (aves) magis humo quam stagno consueverunt ; *ibid.* x. 153, sicco ut consuescat pulvere planta ; Livy, i. 40. 5, quibus ferramentis consueti erant ; Stat. *Theb.* ii. 438, consueta luxu ; also probably *id.* ix. 250, (ungula) consueta campo ; *id.* *Silv.* v. 1. 235 consueta obsequiis. The only sure instance of the dative that I have found is Pliny, *Epp.* viii. 23. 8, dolori consuescere, where the ablative *timore* practically necessitated the dative construction for *dolori*.

insuesco : Col. *de Re Rust.* vi. 4, aqua pecus insuescere. The dative occurs in Tac. *Ann.* xi. 29. 11, quarum corpori insueverat.

suetus : I have found the following examples, given as datives in Harper's *Dictionary* : Virg. *Aen.* v. 414, his ego suetus ; Tac. *Ann.* xiv. 27. 7, neque coniugiis suscipiendis neque alendis liberis sueti ; *id.* *Hist.* v. 6. 15, suetas aquis volucres ; *id.* *Ann.* ii. 52. 3, latrocinii suetos ; Lucan, i. 325, suetus civilibus armis. In all these the form is ambiguous, but in view of the construction with *assuetus*, *consuetus*, *insuetus*, it seems far more likely that the case used with *suetus* is likewise the ablative.

6. VERBS OF ATTENDING AND BEING ATTENDED.

In Vedic *sak-* (Latin *sequor*, Greek *ἑπομαι*) takes the instrumental, though in classical Sanskrit this verb is transitive. The root *hac-* in Avestan also takes the instrumental (Hübschmann,

Casuslehre, p. 255). In Greek, ἐπομαι with the dative is probably a relic of the instrumental usage. In Latin we have :

comitor : Cic. *pro Caelio*, 34, (mulier) alienis viris comitata ; Cat. 63. 32, comitata tympano ; Ovid, *Met.* ii. 441, suo comitata choro ; *ibid.* ii. 845, virginibus Tyriis comitata ; *ibid.* iii. 215, natis comitata duobus ; *ibid.* ix. 687, pompa comitata suorum ; *ibid.* x. 9, turba comitata ; *id. Am.* i. 6. 33, militibus venio comitatus et armis ; Tib. iii. 2. 13, comitata dolore ; Pliny, *N.H.* xxi. 65, gladiolus comitatus hyacintho ; Tac. *Agr.* 40. 19, uno aut altero amicorum comitatus ; *id. Ann.* xiv. 8. 17, trierarcho et centurione comitatus ; Curtius, vi. 5. 26, trecentis feminarum comitata ; Sen. *Phaedra*, 19, comitatae gregibus parvis ; Stat. *Achill.* ii. 309, lacrimis comitata suorum.

stipo : Cic. *ad Att.* i. 18. 1, stipati gregibus ; Prop. iii. 8. 13, custodum grege circa se stipat euntem ; Vell. Pat. ii. 58. 2, stipati gladiatorum manu ; Lucan, iv. 208, turba stipatus.

7. VERBS OF PILING.

accumulo : Lucr. iii. 71, caedem caede accumulantes. I think the meaning is 'piling up murder with murder.'

cumulo : Lucr. vi. 1237, cumulabat funere funus ; Cic. *de Off.* i. 116, Africanus eloquentia cumulavit bellicam gloriam ; *id. in Cat.* i. 14, nonne alio incredibili scelere hoc scelus cumulasti ? *id. Sex. Rosc.* 30, haec aliis cumulant ; Tac. *Agr.* 40. 1, triumphalia ornamenta multo verborum honore cumulata ; *id. Ger.* 27, 2, struem rogi nec vestibus nec odoribus cumulant.

stipo : Hor. *Sat.* ii. 3. 11, stipare Platona Menandro, 'pack Plato with Menander.'

8. VERBS OF PLAYING.

These occur construed with the instrumental in Vedic (Delbrück, *Altindische Syntax*, p. 131), and in Slavic (Miklosich, *Grammatik der slavischen Sprachen*, IV. p. 701). In Latin we have :

ludo : Plaut. *Mil. Glo.* 324, ludis me :: quidum ? :: quia ludo luto ; Ter. *Adelphoe*, 739, quasi quom ludas tesseriis ; Cat. 61. 128, satis diu lusisti nucibus ; Cic. *Phil.* ii. 56, alea ludere ; *id. de Fato*, 34, pila luderem ; Hor. *Odes*, iii. 24. 56, trocho ludere ; Vitruv. *de Arch.* vii. 5. 6, pila ludentes ; Suet. *Aug.* 71, 83, talis ludere.

9. VERBS OF *CHANGING* AND *INTERCHANGING*.

commuto : Cic. *de Rep.* i. 69, genera generibus commutantur novis ; *id. de Lege Agr.* i. 14, possessionis invidiam pecunia commutent ; Lucr. v. 1105, victum vitamque priorem commutare novis rebus ; Caes. *B. G.* vi. 22. 3, ne studium belli gerendi agricultura commutent ; *Auct. ad Herenn.* iv. 38, commutat (verbum) alio verbo ; *ibid.* ii. 29, leve compendium fraude maxima commutarunt ; Ov. *Pont.* iv. 14, 11, Styx commutabitur Istro ; Col., *de Re Rust.*, xii. 26, mustum aere commutato.

The ablative with *cum* also occurs, e.g. Cic. *Epp.* iv. 5. 3, mortem cum vita commutare ; *id. pro Sest.* 37, cum patriae caritate constantiae gloriam commutare.

muto : Plaut. *Capt.* 28, si quem reperire posset qui mutet suum ; so also 101 ; Lucilius, xxvi. 17 (M.), uno hoc non muto omnia ; *ibid.* 15, publicis mutem meos ; Sal. *Iug.* 38. 10, mortis metu mutabantur ; *id. Cat.* 58. 15, pace bellum mutavit ; *id. Hist. Frag.* i. 77. 7 (Maur.), diurna mercede vitam mutaverit ; *ibid.* i. 87, paludamentum toga mutavit ; Virg. *Ecl.* iv. 44, mutabit vellera luto ; *id. Georg.* i. 8, glandem mutavit arista ; *ibid.* ii. 511, exsilio domos mutant ; Hor. *Odes*, i. 16. 25, mitibus mutare tristia ; *ibid.* i. 29. 14, Socraticam domum mutare loricis Hiberis ; *ibid.* i. 34. 12, ima summis mutare ; *id. Epodes*, i. 27, Calabris Lucana mutet pascuis ; *ibid.* 9. 27, punico lugubre mutavit sagum ; *id. Sat.* ii. 7. 109, uvam furtiva mutat strigili ; *id. Epp.* i. 1. 100, mutat quadrata rotundis ; Ovid., *Met.* iv. 397, mutantur palmite ; *ibid.* xi. 741, ambo mutantur alite ; *id. Fast.* iii. 461, periuro mutarat coniuge Bacchum ; *ibid.* iv. 402, mutavit glandes utiliore cibo ; *ibid.* vi. 665, exsilio mutant urbem ; *id. Pont.* iii. 3. 97, mutatur nigra pice lacteus umor ; Livy, v. 30. 3, victrice patria victam mutari ; *id.* ix. 12. 2, victoriae possessionem incerta pace mutasse ; Col. *de Re Rust.* viii. 5. 4, aere mutantur ; *ibid.* ix. 1. 7, aere mutandi sunt ; Val. Max. iv. 8. 2, mutare paupertatem inopia ; *id.* vii. 4. 1, mutavit metum fiducia ; *id.* v. 4. 1, mutavit bellum pace ; *id.* iv. 2. *ad init.* mutatum bellum pace ; Vell. Pat. i. 4. 2, mutat Cumanos Osca vicinia ; Petron. 98, palliolo suo laceratam mutavit vestem ; Lucan, x. 202, mutat diem nocte ; Sen. *Thy.* 298, mutare miseria regno ; Sil. Ital. iii. 227, mutare iugum terris ; *id.* vii. 562, mutare solum sceptris ; *id.* xiv. 214, mutare gemitus mugitibus ; *ibid.* 464, mutare casas marmore ; Pliny, *Epp.* v. 17. 2, excelsa depressis, exilia plenis, severis iucunda mutabat ; Tac. *Ann.* ii. 75. 12, luctum laeto

cultu mutavit ; *ibid.* ii. 6. 19, id vocabulum mutat Mosa flumine ; *ibid.* iii. 44. 10, pacem bello mutari ; *ibid.* iv. 23. 7, libertos regios et servilia imperia bello mutaverant ; *ibid.* xvi. 12. 6, menses Maius Claudii Julius Germanici vocabulis mutantur ; Justin, v. 5. 4, Alcibiadem ducem Conone mutaret.

permuto : Hor. *Odes*, ii. 12. 22, Mygdonias opes permutare velis crine Licymniae ; *ibid.* iii. 1. 47, cur valle permitem Sabina divitias operosiores ; Val. Max. ii. 6. 8, permuto reliquias spiritus mei fine ; *id.* ix. 1. 7, permutare religionem stupro ; Sen. *Thy.* 598, permutat hora ima summis ; Martial, ix. 22. 12, quem permutatum nec Ganymede velis ; *id.* vi. 93. 7, virus ut hoc alio fallax permutet odore ; Sil. Ital. i. 660, permutare culmina muris ; Val. Flacc. v. 424, permutant carbasa bracis.

verto : Hor. *Odes*, i. 35. 4, vertere funeribus triumphos ; *id.* *A.P.* 226, vertere seria ludo ; Ov. *Met.* x. 157, nulla tamen alite verti dignatur.

With *mutō* and its compounds the ablative by many scholars is regarded as one of Means or Price. But in view of the wide extent of the sociative function of the ablative in Latin it seems much more natural to treat the above cases as a sociative development.

10. VERBS OF *MATING*, *WEDDING*, *ETC.*

In Slavic verbs of *marrying*, and *betrothing*, are construed with the instrumental (Miklosich, IV. p. 701), while in Gothic verbs of the same meaning take the dative, which may well represent the instrumental of the parent speech. In Latin we have :

marito : Hor. *Epodes*, 2. 9, adulta vitium propagine altas maritat populos ; Col. *de Re Rust.* xi. 79, ulmi vitibus maritantur ; *ibid.* viii. 2. 12, quae (feminae) ternae singulis maribus maritantur ; Apuleius, *Met.* viii. 8, quovis alio felicius maritare (imv.) ; cf. Claudian, *Rap. Pros.* ii. 89, (Zephyrus) glaebas fecundo rore maritat.

maritus : Hor. *Odes*, iii. 5. 5, milesne Crassi coniuge barbara turpis maritus, 'basely wedded to barbarian mate' ; Ovid, *Her.* 4. 134, et fas omne facit fratre marita soror.

geminor : I should regard as very probably sociative the following from Horace, *A.P.* 13, serpentes avibus gementur, tigris agni, though Landgraf, *Beiträge*, p. 19, takes the case as dative.

adulteror : Hor. *Epodes*, 16. 32, adulteretur columba miluo. For this I see no satisfactory interpretation except to take the ablative as sociative.

pecco : Hor. *Odes*, i. 33. 9, peccet adultero. This seems to me entirely analogous to the preceding example. In Gothic, *gahorinon*, 'commit adultery,' takes the dative, which, as already pointed out, may represent uses of the Indo-European instrumental.

II. VERBS OF *WRESTLING*.

In Vedic we find verbs of *contending* construed with the sociative instrumental (Delbrück, *Altindische Syntax*, p. 131). In Slavic verbs of *wrestling* take the same construction (Miklosich, *Grammatik der slavischen Sprachen*, IV. 701). In Greek verbs of *contending* take the dative, which, as is well known, in many of its functions represents the Indo-European instrumental. Traces of this construction seem to be preserved in Latin, in Lucan, iii. 503, ignis viridi luctetur robore. In Cic. *de Rep.* iv. 4, we have *cum* with the ablative, cum tuo Platone luctari. The two following passages in Horace may also contain ablatives: *Odes*, i. 1. 15, luctantem Icariis fluctibus Africum; *Epp.* ii. 1. 74, luctantur funera plaustris.

12. VERBS OF *AGREEING WITH*.

These appear in Avestan construed with the instrumental (Hübschmann, *Casuslehre*, p. 255). The only Latin example I have noted is Apuleius, *Met.* xi. 15, vultum laetiozem candido isto habitu congruentem. Yet in xi. 27, we find the dative, nocturnae imagini congruentem. Cicero also uses the dative. Hence ambiguous examples, such as Gellius, *N.A.* iii. 3. 3, sermonis Plauto congruentis, are best taken as datives.

13. ADJECTIVES AND ADVERBS OF *EQUALITY*.

par : Sall. *Hist. Frag.* iv. 14, scalas pares moenium altitudine; Ovid, *Fast.*, vi. 804, in qua par facies nobilitate sua. Merkel changes *par* to *pars*; while Peter, who retains the reading of the Mss., has the comment, '*par* (*sc. Anco*) nobilitate.' The sense, I think, is 'features

on a par with her rank'; cf. the repeated occurrence of *par cum*, e.g. Sall. *Jug.* 14. 9, quem tu parem cum liberis tuis fecisti; Cic. *de Rep.* i. 7.

aeque: *aeque cum* occurs in Plautus, *Asin.* 332, ut aequae mecum haec scias, and repeatedly elsewhere. It is therefore possible that the following examples, which are usually classed as Ablatives of Comparison κατὰ σύνεσιν are really sociatives: Plautus, *Amph.* 293, nullus est hoc meticulosus aequae; *Curc.* 141, qui me in terra aequae fortunatus erit?

It is perhaps unnecessary to add by way of conclusion that the very wide range of the construction we have been considering has remained hitherto unrecognized. Most of our important manuals of Latin grammar omit all reference to the idiom, while the few in which it is recognized at all give no indication of its actual scope.